

A Class of Linear Positive Maps in Matrix Algebras

A. Kossakowski
 Institute of Physics
 Nicolaus Copernicus University
 Grudziadzka 5, 87–100 Toruń, Poland
 e-mail: kossak@phys.uni.torun.pl

Abstract

A class of linear positive, trace preserving maps in M_n is given in terms of affine maps in \mathbb{R}^{n^2-1} which map the closed unit ball into itself.

1 Introduction

A linear mapping from a C^* -algebra A into a C^* -algebra B is called *positive* if it carries positive elements of A into positive elements of B . Such a map is said to be *normalised* if the image of the unity of A coincides with the unity of B .

Positive maps have become a common interest to mathematicians and physicist, c.f. [1–31] and [32, 33]. There are several reasons for this:

- (i) The notion of positive map generalizes that of state, $*$ -homomorphism, Jordan homomorphism, and conditional expectation.
- (ii) By duality, a normalised positive map defines an affine mapping between sets of states of C^* -algebras. If these algebras coincide with the C^* -algebras of observables assigned to a physical system, then this affine mapping corresponds to some operation which can be performed on the system.
- (iii) It has been recently shown that there exists a strong connection between the classification of the entanglement of quantum states and the structure of positive maps.

Let $M_k(A)$ be the algebra of $k \times k$ matrices with elements from A and $M_k^+(A)$ be the positive cone in $M_k(A)$. For $k \in \mathbb{N}$ and $\varphi : A \rightarrow B$ define maps $\varphi_k, \bar{\varphi}_k : M_k(A) \rightarrow$

$M_k(B)$, where $\varphi_k([a_{ij}]) = [\varphi(a_{ij})]$ and $\overline{\varphi}_k([a_{ij}]) = [\varphi(a_{ji})]$. The map φ is said to be *k-positive* (*k-copositive*) if the map φ_k ($\overline{\varphi}_k$) is positive, respectively.

A map φ is said to be *k-decomposable* if φ_k is positive whenever $[a_{ij}]$ and $[a_{ji}]$ belong to $M_k^+(A)$. A map $\varphi : A \rightarrow B$ is called *completely positive*, *completely copositive* and *decomposable* if it is *k-positive*, *k-copositive* and *k-decomposable* for all $k \in \mathbb{N}$, respectively. According to the Størmer theorem [10], every decomposable map $\varphi : A \rightarrow B(\mathcal{H})$ ($B(\mathcal{H})$ is the set of bounded linear operators on a complex Hilbert space \mathcal{H}) has the form $\varphi(a) = v^*j(a)v$, where $j : A \rightarrow B(\mathcal{K})$ is a Jordan homomorphism and v is a bounded operator from \mathcal{H} into \mathcal{K} . Since every Jordan homomorphism is the sum of a $*$ -homomorphism and a $*$ -antihomomorphism [3] every decomposable map $\varphi : A \rightarrow B(\mathcal{H})$ has the form $\varphi = \varphi_1 + \varphi_2$, where φ_1 is completely positive and φ_2 is completely copositive. A positive map which is not decomposable is called an *indecomposable* one.

In the case $A = B(\mathcal{H}) = M_n(\mathbb{C})$ every decomposable map $\varphi : M_n(\mathbb{C}) \rightarrow M_n(\mathbb{C})$ can be written in the form

$$\varphi(a) = \sum_k a_k^* a a_k + \sum_k b_k^* a^T b_k, \quad (1.1)$$

where $a_1, a_2, \dots, b_1, b_2, \dots \in M_n(\mathbb{C})$ and T is the transpose map in M_n . It is known [2, 12, 16] that every positive map $\varphi : M_2(\mathbb{C}) \rightarrow M_2(\mathbb{C})$ is decomposable. The first example of an indecomposable map in $M_3(\mathbb{C})$ was given by Choi [7, 8] and its generalizations can be found in [17–31].

There are two known types of indecomposable maps in M_n for $n \geq 3$:

- (i) A series of maps $\varphi_k : M_n(\mathbb{C}) \rightarrow M_n(\mathbb{C})$, $k = 1, \dots, n-2$; c.f. [21, 31]. Let ϵ be the projection of norm one in $M_n(\mathbb{C})$ to the diagonal part with respect to a given basis in \mathbb{C}^n and s be the unitary shift in $M_n(\mathbb{C})$ such that $s = [\delta_{i,j+1}]$, where the indices are understood to be mod n . The maps φ_k are defined as follows

$$\varphi_k(a) = (n-k)\epsilon(a) + \sum_{i=1}^k \epsilon(s^i a s^{*i}) - a. \quad (1.2)$$

Since $\varphi_k(\mathbb{1}_n) = (n-1)\mathbb{1}_n$ and $\text{Tr} \varphi_k(a) = (n-1)\text{Tr} a$, the maps

$$\tau_k(a) = \frac{1}{n-1} \varphi_k(a), \quad k = 1, \dots, n-2, \quad (1.3)$$

are bistochastic ones.

- (ii) A class of maps $\varphi(p_0, p_1, \dots, p_n) : M_n \rightarrow M_n$, c.f. [28, 31] of the form $\varphi(p_0, p_1, \dots, p_n)(a) = a'$ with

$$a'_{11} = p_0 a_{11} + p_n a_{nn}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
a'_{22} &= p_0 a_{22} + p_1 a_{11} \\
\dots &\quad \dots \\
a'_{nn} &= p_0 a_{nn} + p_{n-1} a_{n-1, n-1} \\
a'_{ij} &= -a_{ij},
\end{aligned} \tag{1.4}$$

where

$$p_0, p_1, \dots, p_n > 0, \quad n-1 > p_0 \geq n-2, \quad p_1 \dots p_n \geq (n-1-p_0)^n, \quad n \geq 3. \tag{1.5}$$

The above maps are atomic, i.e., they cannot be decomposed into the sum of a 2-positive and a 2-copositive maps [23, 31].

2 A Class of Positive Maps in M_n

Let φ be a positive, trace preserving map in $M_n(\mathbb{C})$ i.e., a dynamical map [34]. Since φ is self-adjoint, i.e., $\varphi(a^*) = \varphi(a)^*$ it is enough to consider it in the space

$$H_n = \{a \in M_n : a = a^*\}. \tag{2.1}$$

The linear space H_n is the real Hilbert space with the scalar product $(a, b) = \text{Tr}(ab)$ and the norm $\|a\|^2 = (a, a)$.

If $a \in H_n$ and $\text{Tr} a = p > 0$, the necessary condition for positivity of a is $\text{Tr} a^2 \leq (\text{Tr} a)^2 = p^2$, which can also be written in the form

$$\left\| a - \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} \text{Tr} a \right\|^2 \leq \frac{n-1}{n} (\text{Tr} a)^2. \tag{2.2}$$

Let us define the following convex sets in H_n :

$$B_n(p) = \left\{ a \in H_n : \left\| a - \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p \right\|^2 \leq \frac{n-1}{n} p^2, \quad \text{Tr} a = p \right\}, \tag{2.3}$$

$$S_n(p) = \left\{ a \in B_n(p) : a \geq 0 \right\}, \tag{2.4}$$

$$B_n^0(p) = \left\{ a \in H_n : \left\| a - \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p \right\|^2 \leq \frac{1}{n(n-1)} p^2, \quad \text{Tr} a = p \right\}. \tag{2.5}$$

The set $S_n(p=1)$ is just the set of all density operators on \mathbb{C}^n .

Lemma 1 *If $a \in B_n^0(p)$ then $a \geq 0$, i.e., the inclusions*

$$B_n^0(p) \subseteq S_n(p) \subseteq B_n(p) \tag{2.6}$$

hold.

Proof. Let us observe that B_n^0 is invariant with respect to the mapping $\rho \rightarrow U^* \rho U$, $U \in \text{SU}(n)$, and the set

$$b_n^0 = \left\{ p_1, \dots, p_n : \sum_{i=1}^n \left(p_i - \frac{1}{n} p \right)^2 \leq \frac{p^2}{n(n-1)}, \quad \sum_{i=1}^n p_i = p \right\}$$

is the ball inscribed in the set

$$s_n(p) = \left\{ p_1, \dots, p_n : p_i \geq 0, \quad i = 1, \dots, n, \quad \sum_{i=1}^n p_i = p > 0 \right\}.$$

Since the eigenvalues of $a \in B_n^0$ lie in b_n^0 , they are non-negative.

It should be pointed out that in the case $n = 2$ one has

$$B_2^0(p) = S_2(p) = B_2(p). \quad (2.7)$$

Let $\varepsilon_p : B_n(p) \rightarrow B_n^0(p)$ be defined as follows:

$$\varepsilon_p(a) = \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p + \frac{1}{n-1} \left(a - \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p \right) = \frac{1}{n-1} a + \left(1 - \frac{1}{n-1} \right) \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p. \quad (2.8)$$

The map ε_p is positive and trace preserving. It is convenient to introduce an orthonormal base in H_n : f_1, \dots, f_{n^2} such that $(f_\alpha, f_\beta) = \delta_{\alpha\beta}$ and $f_{n^2} = \mathbb{1}_n / \sqrt{n}$, i.e. $\text{Tr} f_\alpha = 0$ for $\alpha = 1, \dots, n^2 - 1$. Every element of $a \in H_n$ can be written in the form

$$a = \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n^2} x_\alpha f_\alpha, \quad x_\alpha = \text{Tr}(a f_\alpha) \quad (2.9)$$

or

$$a = \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} \text{Tr} a + \langle f, x \rangle, \quad (2.10)$$

where $x = (x_1, \dots, x_{n^2-1}) \in \mathbb{R}^{n^2-1}$, $f = (f_1, \dots, f_{n^2-1})$, and

$$\langle f, x \rangle = \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n^2-1} f_\alpha x_\alpha. \quad (2.11)$$

Let $B(\mathbb{R}^n, r)$ be the closed ball in \mathbb{R}^n with the radius r , i.e.,

$$B(\mathbb{R}^n, r) = \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^n : \langle x, x \rangle \leq r \}. \quad (2.12)$$

Let \mathcal{D}_n denote the set of affine maps $(T, b) : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$, where

$$(T, b)x = Tx + b, \quad T \in M_n(\mathbb{R}), \quad b \in \mathbb{R}^n, \quad (2.13)$$

which maps the closed unit ball $B(\mathbb{R}^n, 1)$ into itself. Since \mathcal{D}_n is convex, compact and finite-dimensional, each element of \mathcal{D}_n can be written as a finite convex combination of its extreme elements. The extreme elements of \mathcal{D}_n have been classified in [16] in the following manner:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Extr } \mathcal{D}_n &= \left\{ (T, b) : T = R_1 \Lambda R_2, b = R_1 c, R_1, R_2 \in O(n), \right. \\ \Lambda &= \|\lambda_i \delta_{ij}\|, \lambda_1 = \dots = \lambda_{n-1} = [1 - \delta^2(1 - \kappa^2)]^{1/2}, \lambda_n = \kappa[1 - \delta^2(1 - \kappa^2)]^{1/2}, \\ &\left. c_1 = \dots = c_{n-1} = 0, c_n = \delta(1 - \kappa^2), 0 \leq \kappa \leq 1, 0 < \delta \leq 1 \right\}. \end{aligned} \quad (2.14)$$

It is clear that the map (T, rb) maps the ball $B(\mathbb{R}^n, r)$ into itself provided $(T, y) \in \mathcal{D}_n$.

Let us observe that the subset $\text{Extr } \mathcal{D}_n^0$ of $\text{Extr } \mathcal{D}_n$ corresponding to $\kappa = 1$ has the form

$$\text{Extr } \mathcal{D}_n^0 = \{(T, y) : T \in O(n), y = 0\}. \quad (2.15)$$

Taking into account (2.3), (2.9) and (2.10) one finds that an element $a \in B_n(p)$ can be represented in the form

$$a = \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p + \langle f, x \rangle, \quad p = \text{Tr } a, \quad \text{where } x \in B\left(\mathbb{R}^{n^2-1}, p\left(\frac{n-1}{n}\right)^{1/2}\right), \quad (2.16)$$

while the map ε_p , c.f. (2.8) takes the form

$$\varepsilon_p(a) = \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p + \frac{1}{n-1} \langle f, x \rangle. \quad (2.17)$$

Composing the map ε_p with the map $\psi : B_n(p) \rightarrow B_n(p)$ given by

$$\psi\left[T, yp\left(\frac{n-1}{n}\right)^{1/2}\right](a) = \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p + \left\langle f, yp\left(\frac{n-1}{n}\right)^{1/2} \right\rangle \quad (2.18)$$

one finds that the composed map $\varphi[(T, y)] : B_n(p) \rightarrow B_n^0(p) \subseteq B_n(p)$ has the form

$$\varphi[T, y](a) = \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} p + \frac{1}{n-1} \left\langle f, Tx + py\left(\frac{n-1}{n}\right)^{1/2} \right\rangle, \quad (2.19)$$

where $(T, y) \in \mathcal{D}_{n^2-1}$, is a positive one by the construction. Since the map (2.19) is homogeneous it can be extended to H_n , and its extension to M_n is given by

$$\varphi[T, y](c + id) = \varphi[T, y](c) + i\varphi[T, y](d) \quad \text{for } c, d \in H_n. \quad (2.20)$$

The main result can be summarized in the following

Theorem 1 Every affine map (T, y) which maps the closed unit ball in \mathbb{R}^{n^2-1} into itself induces a positive, trace preserving map $\varphi(T, y) : M_n \rightarrow M_n$

$$\varphi[T, y](a) = \frac{\mathbb{1}_n}{n} \text{Tr} a + \frac{1}{n-1} \left\langle f, Tx + y \left(\frac{n-1}{n} \right)^{1/2} \text{Tr} a \right\rangle, \quad (2.21)$$

where $x = (x_1, \dots, x_{n^2-1}) \in \mathbb{R}^{n^2-1}$, $x_\alpha = \text{Tr}(af_\alpha)$, and $f = (f_1, f_2, \dots, f_{n^2-1})$, $f_\alpha = f_\alpha^*$, $\text{Tr}(f_\alpha f_\beta) = \delta_{\alpha\beta}$, $\text{Tr} f_\alpha = 0$, $\alpha, \beta = 1, \dots, n^2-1$.

It should be pointed out that in the case $n = 2$ every positive, trace preserving map has the form (2.21).

A systematic construction of the operators $f_1, \dots, f_{n^2-1} \in H_n$ (generators of $\text{SU}(n)$) is well known, c.f. [35]. They are given by

$$(f_1, \dots, f_{n^2-1}) = (d_\ell, u_{k\ell}, v_{k\ell}), \quad \ell = 1, \dots, n-1, \quad 1 \leq k < \ell \leq n, \quad (2.22)$$

$$d_\ell = \frac{1}{\sqrt{\ell(\ell+1)}} \sum_{k=1}^{\ell} (e_{kk} - k e_{k+1, k+1}), \quad \ell = 1, \dots, n-1, \quad (2.23)$$

$$u_{k\ell} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (e_{k\ell} - e_{\ell k}), \quad (2.24)$$

$$v_{k\ell} = \frac{-i}{\sqrt{2}} (e_{k\ell} - e_{\ell k}), \quad (2.25)$$

$$e_{k\ell} = e_k(e_\ell, \cdot), \quad (2.26)$$

where (e_1, \dots, e_n) is an orthonormal base in \mathbb{C}^n .

As an illustration of the formula (2.21) let us consider the case $n = 3$. Using the notation

$$x_1 = \text{Tr}(ad_1), \quad x_2 = \text{Tr}(ad_2) \quad (2.27)$$

and

$$x_{k\ell} = \text{Tr}(au_{k\ell}), \quad y_{k\ell} = \text{Tr}(av_{k\ell}) \quad (2.28)$$

let us consider the rotation $R(\alpha) \in \text{SO}(8)$ given by

$$\begin{aligned} x'_1 &= x_1 \cos \alpha - x_2 \sin \alpha, \\ x'_2 &= x_1 \sin \alpha + x_2 \cos \alpha, \\ x'_{k\ell} &= -x_{k\ell}, \\ y'_{k\ell} &= -y_{k\ell}, \quad 1 \leq k < \ell \leq n. \end{aligned} \quad (2.29)$$

Taking into account the explicit form of $d_1, d_2, u_{k\ell}, v_{k\ell}$, $1 \leq k < \ell \leq 3$, one finds that the corresponding map $\varphi[\alpha] \equiv \varphi[R(\alpha), 0] : M_3(\mathbb{C}) \rightarrow M_3(\mathbb{C})$ has the form

$a' = \varphi[\alpha](a)$, where

$$\begin{aligned}
a'_{11} &= \frac{1}{2}[\lambda(\alpha)a_{11} + \mu(\alpha)a_{22} + \nu(\alpha)a_{33}], \\
a'_{22} &= \frac{1}{2}[\nu(\alpha)a_{11} + \lambda(\alpha)a_{22} + \mu(\alpha)a_{33}], \\
a'_{33} &= \frac{1}{2}[\mu(\alpha)a_{11} + \nu(\alpha)a_{22} + \lambda(\alpha)a_{33}], \\
a'_{ij} &= -\frac{1}{2}a_{ij}, \quad i \neq j,
\end{aligned} \tag{2.30}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}
\lambda(\alpha) &= \frac{2}{3}(1 + \cos \alpha), \\
\mu(\alpha) &= \frac{2}{3}\left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\cos \alpha - \frac{\sqrt{3}}{2}\sin \alpha\right), \\
\nu(\alpha) &= \frac{2}{3}\left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\cos \alpha + \frac{\sqrt{3}}{2}\sin \alpha\right), \\
\lambda(\alpha) + \mu(\alpha) + \nu(\alpha) &= 2.
\end{aligned} \tag{2.31}$$

The special cases are:

(i) $a' = \varphi[\alpha = \pi/3](a)$

$$\begin{aligned}
a'_{11} &= \frac{1}{2}(a_{11} + a_{33}), \\
a'_{22} &= \frac{1}{2}(a_{22} + a_{11}), \\
a'_{33} &= \frac{1}{2}(a_{33} + a_{22}), \\
a'_{ij} &= -\frac{1}{2}a_{ij}.
\end{aligned}$$

(ii) $a' = \varphi[\alpha = -\pi/3](a)$

$$\begin{aligned}
a'_{11} &= \frac{1}{2}(a_{11} + a_{22}), \\
a'_{22} &= \frac{1}{2}(a_{22} + a_{33}), \\
a'_{33} &= \frac{1}{2}(a_{33} + a_{11}), \\
a'_{ij} &= -\frac{1}{2}a_{ij}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$(iii) \quad a' = \varphi[\alpha = \pi](a) = 1/2(\mathbb{1}_3 \text{Tr} a - a)$$

$$(iv) \quad a' = \varphi[\alpha = 0](a) = 1/3\varphi[\alpha = \pi](a) + (1 - 1/3)\psi(a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} a'' &= \psi(a), \\ a''_{11} &= a_{11}, \quad a''_{22} = a_{22}, \quad a''_{33} = a_{33}, \\ a''_{ij} &= -\frac{1}{2}a_{ij}. \end{aligned}$$

The maps (i) and (ii) are indecomposable Choi's maps, the map (iii) is completely copositive, while (iv) is decomposable.

Let $[x_{ij}] \in M_3(M_3)$ be the matrix

$$[x_{ij}] = \left(\begin{array}{ccc|ccc|ccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & p & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & p^{-1} & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \hline 0 & 0 & 0 & p^{-1} & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & p & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \hline 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & p & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & p^{-1} & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{array} \right) \quad p > 0. \quad (2.32)$$

Then both $[x_{ij}]$ and $[x_{ji}]$ belong to $M_3(M_3)^+$. It is easily seen that the matrix $[\varphi[\alpha](x_{ij})]$ is not positive for $0 < \alpha < \pi$, i.e., the map $\varphi[\alpha]$ is indecomposable for $0 < \alpha < \pi$.

It should be pointed out that the indecomposable maps (1.4) does not belong to the class considered above.

References

- [1] W.F. Stinespring, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **6**, 211 (1955).
- [2] E. Størmer, Acta Math. **110**, 233 (1963).
- [3] E. Størmer, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **120**, 438 (1965).
- [4] E. Størmer, in: Lecture Notes in Physics **29**, Springer Verlag, Berlin, 1974, pp. 85–106.

- [5] W. Arverson, *Acta Math.* **123**, 141 (1969).
- [6] M.D. Choi, *Lin. Alg. Appl.* **10**, 285 (1975).
- [7] M.D. Choi, *Lin. Alg. Appl.* **12**, 95 (1975).
- [8] M.D. Choi, *J. Operator Theory* **4**, 271 (1980).
- [9] E. Størmer, *Math. Ann.* **247**, 21 (1980).
- [10] E. Størmer, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **86**, 402 (1982).
- [11] E. Størmer, *J. Funct. Anal.* **66**, 235 (1985).
- [12] S.L. Woronowicz, *Rep. Math. Phys.* **10**, 165 (1976).
- [13] S.L. Woronowicz, *Comm. Math. Phys.* **51**, 243 (1976).
- [14] A. Jamiokowski, *Rep. Math. Phys.* **3**, 275 (1972).
- [15] L.E. Labuschagne, W. A. Majewski, M. Marciniak, to appear.
- [16] V. Gorini, E. C. G. Sudarshan, *Comm. Math. Phys.* **46**, 43 (1976).
- [17] B.M. Terhal, *Lin. Alg. Appl.* **323**, 61 (2001).
- [18] A. G. Robertson, *Math. Proc. Camb. Phil. Soc.* **94**, 291 (1983).
- [19] A. G. Robertson, *Proc. Roy. Soc. Edinburgh* **94 A**, 71 (1983).
- [20] A. G. Robertson, *J. Lond. Math. Soc. (2)* **32**, 133 (1985).
- [21] T. Ando, seminar note 1985.
- [22] J. Tomiyama, *Contemporary Math.* **62**, 357 (1987).
- [23] K. Tanahashi, J. Tomiyama, *Canadian Math. Bull.* **31**, 308 (1988).
- [24] T. Takasaki, J. Tomiyama, *Math. Japonica* **1**, 129 (1982).
- [25] S.H. Kye, in: *Elementary operators and applications*, M. Mathion, ed., World Scientific, 1992.
- [26] S. J. Cho, *Lin. Alg. Appl.* **171**, 213 (1992).
- [27] H. Osaka, *Lin. Alg. Appl.* **153**, 73 (1991).
- [28] H. Osaka, *Publ. RIMS Kyoto Univ.* **28**, 747 (1992).

- [29] H. Osaka, *Lin. Alg. Appl.* **186**, 45 (1992).
- [30] K. C. Ha, *Publ. RIMS Univ.* **34**, 591 (1998).
- [31] K. C. Ha, *Lin. Alg. Appl.* **359**, 277 (2003).
- [32] M. Horodecki, P. Horodecki, R. Horodecki, *Phys. Rev. Lett A* **223**, 1 (1996).
- [33] G. Albert, T. Beth, M. Horodecki, P. Horodecki, R. Horodecki, M. Rötter, H. Weinfurter, R. Werner, A. Zeinlinger, *Quantum Information*, Springer Tracts in Modern Physics **173**, Springer Verlag, Berlin, 2001.
- [34] E. C. G. Sudarshan, P. M. Mathews, J. Rau, *Phys. Rev.* **121**, 920 (1961).
- [35] F. T. Hioe, J. H. Eberly, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **47**, 838 (1981).